

OPEN ACCESS



African Journal of Business Management

28 June 2019

ISSN: 1993-8233

DOI: 10.5897/AJBM

www.academicjournals.org



**ACADEMIC
JOURNALS**

expand your knowledge

About AJBM

The African Journal of Business Management (AJBM) is published twice monthly (one volume per year) by Academic Journals.

African Journal of Business Management (AJBM) is an open access journal that publishes research analysis and inquiry into issues of importance to the business community. Articles in AJBM examine emerging trends and concerns in the areas of general management, business law, public responsibility and ethics, marketing theory and applications, business finance and investment, general business research, business and economics education, production/operations management, organizational behaviour and theory, strategic management policy, social issues and public policy, management organization, statistics and econometrics, personnel and industrial relations, technology and innovation, case studies, and management information systems. The goal of AJBM is to broaden the knowledge of business professionals and academicians by promoting free access and providing valuable insight to business-related information, research and ideas. AJBM is a weekly publication and all articles are peer-reviewed.

Contact Us

Editorial Office: ajbm@academicjournals.org

Help Desk: helpdesk@academicjournals.org

Website: <http://www.academicjournals.org/journal/AJBM>

Submit manuscript online <http://ms.academicjournals.me/>

Editor-in-Chief

Prof. Wilfred Isioma Ukpere

*Department of Industrial Psychology and People Management,
Faculty of Management,
University of Johannesburg,
South Africa.*

Editors

Dr. Amran Awang

*Faculty of Business Management,
02600 Arau, Perlis, Malaysia*

Prof. Giurca Vasilescu Laura

*University of Craiova, Romania
13, A.I. Cuza, 200585, Craiova, Dolj,
Romania.*

Associate Editors

Dr. Ilse Botha

*University of Johannesburg
APK Campus PO Box 524 Aucklandpark 2006
South Africa.*

Dr. Howard Qi

*Michigan Technological University
1400 Townsend Dr., Houghton, MI 49931,
U.S.A.*

Dr. Aktham AlMaghaireh

*United Arab Emirates University
Department of Economics & Finance
United Arab Emirates.*

Dr. Haretsebe Manwa

*University of Botswana
Faculty of Business
University of Botswana
P.O. Box UB 70478
Gaborone Botswana.*

Dr. Reza Gharoie Ahangar

*Islamic Azad University of Babol,
Iran.*

Dr. Sérgio Dominique Ferreira

*Polytechnic Institute of Cavado and Ave
Campus IPCA, Lugar does Aldão, 4750-810. Vila
Frescainha,
Portugal.*

Prof. Ravinder Rena

*Department of Economics
University of the Western Cape
Private Bag: X17
Modderdam Road
Bellville 7535
Cape town, South Africa*

Dr. Shun-Chung Lee

*Taiwan Institute of Economic Research
No. 16-8, Dehuei Street, Jhongshan District,
Taipei City 104,
Taiwan.*

Dr. Kuo-Chung Chu

*National Taipei University of Nursing and Health
Sciences No. 365, Min-Te Road, Taipei,
Taiwan.*

Dr. Gregory J. Davids

*University of the Western Cape
Private Bag x17, Bellville 7535,
South Africa.*

Prof. Victor Dragotă

*Bucharest Academy of Economic Studies, Department
of Finance
Bucharest, Sector 1, Piata Romana no. 6, Room 1104,
Romania*

Dr. Maurice Oscar Dassah

*School of Management, IT and Governance
University of KwaZulu-Natal
Post Office Box X54001
Durban
4000
South Africa.*

Prof. Joseph Offiong Udoayang
University of Calabar
P.M.B 1115, Calabar. Cross River State, Nigeria.

Prof. Robert Taylor
University of KwaZulu-Natal
Varsity Drive, Westville
South Africa.

Dr. Nazim Taskin
Massey University - Albany
Quad Building A, Room 3.07
Gate 1, Dairy Flat Highway (State Highway 17)Albany,
New Zealand

Prof. João J. M. Ferreira
University of Beira Interior (UBI)
Estrada do Sineiro, Pólo IV 6200 Covilhã,
Portugal.

Dr. Izah Mohd Tahir
Universiti Sultan Zainal Abidin
Gong Badak Campus, 21300 Kuala Terengganu,
Terengganu, Malaysia.

Dr. V. Mahalakshmi
Panimalar Engineering College
7-A,CID Quarters, Mandaveli,Chennai-600028,
Tamilnadu,
India.

Dr. Ata Allah Taleizadeh
Iran University of Science and Technology
Faculty of Industrial Engineering,
Iran University of Science and Technology,
Narmak, Tehran, Iran.

Dr. P.S. Vohra
Chandigarh Group of Colleges, Landran, Mohali, India
#3075, Sector 40 D
Chandigarh, Pin code 160036

Dr. José M. Merigó
University of Barcelona
Department of Business Administration, Av. Diagonal
690, Spain.

Prof. Mornay Roberts-Lombard
Department of Marketing Management,
C-Ring 607, Kingsway campus, University of
Johannesburg, Auckland Park, Johannesburg, 2006,
South Africa

Dr. Anton Sorin Gabriel
Carol I Boulevard, No. 11, 700506, Iasi,
Alexandru Ioan Cuza University Iasi,
Romania.

Dr. Aura Emanuela Domil
31 Horia Creanga, zip code 300253, Timisoara,
West University from Timisoara,
Faculty of Economics and Business Administration, Romania.

Dr. Guowei Hua
NO. 3 Shangyuancun, Haidian District, Beijing 100044,
School of Economics and Management,
Beijing Jiaotong University, China.

Dr. Mehdi Toloo
Technical University of Ostrava,
Ostrava, Czech Republic

Dr. Surendar Singh
Department of Management Studies, Invertis University
Invertis village, Bareilly -
Lucknow Highway, N.H.-24, Bareilly
(U.P.) 243 123 India.

Dr. Nebojsa Pavlovic
High school "Djura Jaksic"
Trska bb, 34210 Raca, Serbia.

Dr. Colin J. Butler
University of Greenwich
Business School, University of Greenwich, Greenwich, SE10
9LS,
London, UK.

Prof. Dev Tewari
School of Economics and Finance
Westville Campus University of Kwa-Zulu
Natal (UKZN) Durban, 4001
South Africa.

Dr. Paloma Bernal Turnes
Universidad Rey Juan Carlos
Dpto. Economía de la Empresa
Pº de los Artilleros s/n
Edif. Departamental, Desp. 2101
28032 Madrid, España

Dr. Jurandir Peinado
Universidade Positivo
Rua Silveira Peixoto, 306
Zip 80240-120 Curitiba – PR – Brazil

Table of Content

Investigating the challenges that the cross-border women traders face in Malawi: The Limbe Town women traders of Southern Malawi	396
Nelson Nanteleza Ndala and Francis Moto Jnr.	
Incentives as correlates of employees' loyalty towards management in organisation	407
Idowu H. A. O., Soyebó K. O. and Adeoye E. A.	

Review

Investigating the challenges that the cross-border women traders face in Malawi: The Limbe Town women traders of Southern Malawi

Nelson Nanteleza Ndala* and Francis Moto Jnr.

School of Commerce, Malawi College of Accountancy, Malawi.

Received 15 April, 2019; Accepted 17 May, 2019

Women in Malawi have been at the forefront of cross border trade both as a source of income and employment though they face numerous challenges. The paper investigates the challenges that the cross-border women face in the case of Limbe ICBT. A sample size of 30 participants was targeted that included 28 women cross-border traders, taxation authorities and Indigenous Business Association of Malawi (IBAM) officials. This data was analyzed using descriptive statistics. In total 24, valid questionnaires were collected from the 30 participants. Challenges identified were lack of adequate funds to support businesses, high taxes, transportation costs, corruption by taxation-authorities officials, competition from big companies, unstable exchange rate and unstable prices from the market. The study revealed the relationship that exists between taxation authorities, women ICBT and IBAM though the relationship is not as strong as expected. It was established that none of the ICBT women were aware of the existence of regional protocols and none seem to be knowledgeable about cross-border rules, regulations and other protocols when it comes to clearance of goods and services. Most of the ICBT do not know how the calculations of import duties and how other charges occur. They have no knowledge of how they are charged at the border. One of contributing factors is their level of education which is very low leading to poor understanding of rules, regulations and import protocols. It is recommended that taxation authorities should embark on providing comprehensive training to these women if they are to maximize the duty collection.

Key words: Women traders, small and medium-sized enterprises, Informal Cross Border Traders (ICBT), SADC.

INTRODUCTION

The government of Malawi recognizes the contribution made by micro, small and medium enterprises in stimulating competition, providing employment and distributing wealth. Most of the SME's are run by cross border women. However, little achievement has been made by these women; as such there is a need to

develop the policy that aims at supporting cross border women in Malawi. Small and medium enterprises (SMEs) are businesses whose personnel numbers fall below certain limits. The abbreviation "SME's is used in international organizations such as the World Bank, and the World Trade Organization (WTO). Small enterprises

*Corresponding author. E-mail: nanteleza70@gmail.com.

outnumber large companies by a wide margin and also employ many more people. SMEs are also said to be responsible for driving innovation and competition in many economic sectors. According to a survey that was conducted by Fin scope (MSME, 2012), Malawi has about 987,480 SME's, 758,118 SME's owners, employing about 1,050,320 people and give revenue of about MK 326 billion.

The women entrepreneurs play a great role in the society. But despite this, they do also face a lot of challenges in course of doing their business. Schreyer (2009) contends that the small business sector is a major source of net job creation. Carter (2000) asserts that MSEs have a propensity to employ more labour intensive production processes than large enterprises. Consequently, they contribute significantly to the provision of productive employment opportunities, generation of income and equality as well as the reduction of poverty (Kongolo, 2010). Therefore, this research paper was investigating the challenges the women entrepreneurs especially cross border Small and Medium Scale Enterprise (SME's) face with the aim of coming up with suggested solutions. The study focused on the (SME's) women in Limbe and explored some solutions to the surfaced challenges. It is believed the research findings will have an impact and significance to cross border women because it will be presented to the government of Malawi and other key stakeholders who support and champion the progression of SME's with the belief that appropriate action will be taken.

SME's especially cross border women both informal and formal face a lot of challenges emanating from high running cost, high customs duty, high transportation, infrastructure, and inadequate capital. Through experience and exposure to these women it has been noted that this group of people face a lot of challenges but little has been investigated and done to address the challenges. This was a motivational factor for this research.

Problem statement

It is a known fact that the SMEs headed by business women get massive support from each other and also from government. For example, Malawi government came up with a policy entitled Micro, small and medium Enterprises Policy strategy with its motto called "Enabling Enterprise Growth in Malawi." The establishment of youth enterprise development fund was one of the governments support towards SME's.

Nevertheless, despite government policies and programs that are aimed at supporting the SMEs and by creating what would be viewed as a conducive environment for the SMEs to thrive in the country, the cross-border SMEs owned by women face numerous challenges in the borders, and as such they have

performed below expectations. The number of women enterprises is growing in Malawi. More women have become self-employed and owners of micro, small, medium enterprises. Unfortunately, they do encounter a number of problems which have hindered their business from growing into large scale enterprise/industries that can contribute to the economic development of Malawi.

The problems that SMEs owned by women face are, firstly that, money generated from their business is minimal and it becomes difficult for them to support their families. Secondly, it is difficult for them to pay rentals and other expenses which may lead to closure of their business.

Thirdly, the exorbitant tax regime in the borders is also another challenge. Fourthly, women traders are also more likely to have limited numeracy and literacy skills compared to men, and as a result find navigating trade regulations and procedures more difficult. In most of the cases they have no choice but to resort to bribing customs officials (Africa Regional Empowerment and Accountability Programme, 2015). By looking at different researches conducted previously, little has been said about cross border women challenges. This paper is aimed at exploring some of the business challenges that the cross-border SMEs owned by women face that affect the survival and development of business.

The overall aim of this paper is to investigate the main challenges that affect the cross-border SMEs owned by women, specifically women doing business in the City of Blantyre, Limbe Town. Therefore, the paper attempts:

- i. To identify the challenges which affect cross-border SMEs owned by women which prevent them from playing the vital role in the economic growth and development of the country.
- ii. To assess the contribution made by cross border SME's women to the economy of Blantyre City, Limbe Town.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Cross border trade involves a greater number of female than male entrepreneurs, thus promoting the empowerment of women in the Southern Africa Development Community. Most of the women cross-border traders are aged between 25 and 35 years. This trade has been going on for several years but under very difficult circumstances (Peberdy, 2000).

The role that SMEs play worldwide

Small business sector is a major source of job creation (Schreyer, 1996). MSEs have a propensity to employ more labour intensive production processes than large enterprises. Consequently, they contribute significantly to the provision of productive employment opportunities,

generation of income and equality and the reduction of poverty (Kongolo, 2010).

There is growing recognition of the important role that the small and medium scale enterprises (SMEs) play in economic development. They are often described as efficient and prolific job creators, the seeds for big businesses and the fuel of national economic engines. Even in the developed industrial economies, the SMEs sector is the largest employer of people. Interestingly, the role of SMEs in the development process continues to be in the forefront of policy debates in the country. Governments at all levels have undertaken initiatives to promote the growth of SMEs. More generally, the development of SMEs is seen as accelerating the achievement of wider socio-economic objectives, including poverty alleviation. Thus, governments throughout the world focus on the development of the SMEs sector to promote economic growth.

It is therefore imperative that governments need to pay increased attention to the SMEs and try to create a business environment that will be beneficial to SMEs development. The lack of skills, lack of credit facilities in general and export credit in particular, and as most credit requires collateral this also limits if not prevents access to finance, lack of information on export markets, lack of technology to produce quality goods and achieve high productivity (MSME, 2012).

Collateral are the assets that are pledged by a borrower to a lender as a security for the re-payment of debt. Collateral requirement is seen as an obstacle to SME's growth. Lack of collateral is ranked as obstacle number two from lack of finance. The lack of collateral is probably the most widely cited obstacle encountered by MSEs accessing finance (Kihimbo et al., 2012). The enterprise may be unable to provide sufficient collateral because it is too new or is not firmly enough established (Olawale and Garwe, 2010).

Lending to MSEs is seen as high-risk business since most of these enterprises lack collateral. The problem does not appear to be lack of funds but rather how to make them accessible to MSEs (Kihimbo et al., 2012). There are institutions such as banks and non-bank financial institutions that are willing to provide funds to MSEs but are not able to meet the requirements of these financial institutions and among these requirements is the issue of collateral, which most MSEs cannot provide (Ackah and Vulvor, 2011).

The demand for collateral by banks and other financial institutions stifle the growth of MSEs (Kunateh, 2009). Lending to MSEs is more likely to be based on collateral than is the case for loans for large firms. This may lead to situations in which lending is not based on expected return but rather upon access to collateral. Many MSEs lacking access to 'good collateral' suffer from credit rationing (Nonso, 2013).

Collateral matters because of three essential features of formal credit markets. First, borrowers face requirements

for collateral in the formal financial sector of most countries, regardless of the size of the economy. It is argued that loans secured by collateral have more favorable terms than unsecured loans do, for any given borrower or size of the loan. A borrower who is able to offer collateral can obtain a larger loan relative to the borrower's income, with a larger payment period and a lower interest rate. Conversely, a borrower who cannot provide the type of assets lenders require as collateral often gets worse loan terms than an otherwise similar borrower who can do so, or gets no loan at all. Secondly, it is argued that in most low- and middle-income countries, most firms receive none of the benefits of collateral despite having a wide array of productive assets because their assets cannot serve as collateral. This limitation arises entirely from the legal framework for secured transactions. It can, therefore, be concluded that secured loans are the most common loans in the formal financial sector. In low- and middle-income countries, between 70% and 80% of firms applying for a loan are required to pledge some form of collateral (Fleisig et al., 2006).

In Kenya, there are many MSEs which despite their high potential have been unable to access financing from existing institution in the financial sector. Such situations may be due to the inability of the MSE to offer sufficient loan collateral. In a study in four East Africa countries it was established that 94% of the banks in the sample demanded collateral from their MSE borrowers. They found that collateral requirements for MSE loans are higher than consumer loans because SMEs' credit risk is usually more difficult to evaluate. Informality of MSEs came out as the main reason why banks in the region require that MSEs in the region lodge security relative to corporate clients.

Despite the potential role of SMEs in accelerating economic growth and job creation in developing countries, a number of bottlenecks affect their ability to realize their full potential. SME development is hampered by a number of factors including finance, lack of managerial skills, equipment and technology, regulatory issues, and access to international markets. The lack of managerial know-how places significant constraints on SME development. Even though SMEs tend to attract motivated managers, they can hardly compete with larger firms. The scarcity of management talent prevalent in most countries in the region has a magnified impact on SMEs (Aryeetey, 1994). The lack of support services or their relatively higher unit cost can hamper SMEs' efforts to improve their management because consulting firms are often not equipped with appropriate cost-effective management solutions for SMEs. Besides, despite the numerous institutions providing training and advisory services, there is still a skills gap in the SME sector as a whole (Dalitso and Peter, 2000). This is because entrepreneurs cannot afford the high cost of training and advisory services while others do not see the need to

upgrade their skills due to complacency. In terms of technology, SMEs often have difficulties in gaining access to appropriate technologies and information on available techniques (Aryeetey, 1994). In most cases, SMEs utilize foreign technology with a scarce percentage of shared ownership or leasing. They usually acquire foreign licenses because local patents are difficult to obtain.

An analysis of survey and research results of SMEs in South Africa, for instance, reveals common reactions from SME owners interviewed. When asked what they perceive as constraints in their businesses and especially in establishing or expanding their businesses, they answered that access to funds is a major constraint. This is reflected in perception questions answered by SME owners in many surveys (Gockel and Akoena, 2002). This situation is not different in the case of Malawi according to survey done by Finscope (MSME, 2012).

The role that cross-border SME'S play

Cross border traders supported on average 3.2 children as well as 3.1 dependents who were not children or spouses (Peberdy and Rogerson, 2000). Informal cross-border traders are playing an important role in the circulation of goods from areas with excess supplies to those deficit areas. In this period, informal cross-border traders serving rural areas provided agriculture inputs and industrial consumer goods to farmers and contributed in the commercialization of the farmer's produce (Justice, 2010).

Challenges that cross-border SME's face

Despite their significant contributions, Informal Cross Border Traders (ICBT) faces significant constraints when doing business. Women ICBTs in particular still suffer stigmatization, violence, harassment, poor working conditions and lack of recognition of their economic contribution. Some of the challenges identified by the UNIFEM 2007–2009 research include cumbersome border processes, bribery and corruption at border posts, lack of policy recognition of ICBTs at national and regional levels, weak organization of ICBTs at national and regional levels, poor dissemination of information on the SADC trade protocol and other customs rules and regulations, poor infrastructure at border posts, ranging from lack of clean toilets to lack of storage space; import restrictions, sexual coercion in some places, vulnerability to HIV and AIDS, inability to meet certain health, sanitary, and environmental requirements, harassment of women ICBTs, including unwarranted impounding of goods and humiliating body searches, and excessive, arbitrary, or inconsistent customs charges, often as part of bribe-seeking. There is also the danger entailed in using risky informal border crossing points, including wild animal

corridors, as found by researchers in Botswana (Blumberg, Meyers and Malaba, 2016).

Despite the growth of intraregional and total trade in the region, opportunities for expansion of trade through greater integration in COMESA and SADC appear limited since product complementarities and levels of intraregional trade are low, and there is a risk of polarization. Factors that hinder African trade include distorted trade regimes, high transaction costs due to high transportation costs, as in the case of Malawi, inadequate information and communication infrastructure, lack of political will, policy reversals, difficulties in implementing harmonization provisions, multiple and conflicting objectives of overlapping regional arrangements and limited human capacity (UNCTAD, 2006).

The lack of convergence in SADC Member States' external tariff and trade policies is also a threat to mutual cooperation and becomes unnecessarily unwieldy for informal cross border traders. What further complicates the situation is the fact that most SADC countries belong to more than one regional trade block. SADC countries are members of five overlapping economic groups that include SADC, COMESA, East African Community (EAC), Southern African Customs Union (SACU) and Indian Ocean Community (IOC). These regional trade blocs do not necessarily have similar aims and their overlapping membership makes life difficult for informal cross border traders who would prefer harmonization in the trading regime (Makombe, 2011). Many border officials ask for bribes to make a smooth clearance. If the trader does not pay, it will cost a lot and may take several extra days to cross the border. The cases are reported to the authorities but the authorities ask for receipts. Of course, nobody gives receipts for bribes! It is also very difficult for a cross border trader to access low interest loans from national banks (Justice, 2010).

There is vulnerability of traders to corruption by customs officials. They may take advantage of their lack of knowledge of certain customs procedures, and harass them with the aim of extorting money from them (Justice, 2010).

There is also limited knowledge of procedures. These include customs and related charges and taxes. This is particularly relevant for importing the goods on which informal traders rely. Where knowledge does exist, the procedures are cumbersome (Network Economic Justice, 2010).

The role that women owned cross-border SMEs play

Small and medium enterprises operated by women in Malawi are believed to contribute significantly to the country's Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and account for an increase of businesses in Malawi. SMEs therefore have a crucial role to play in stimulating growth, generating employment and contributing to poverty

alleviation, given their economic importance in the country.

Cross-border trading is one type of the SMEs and is often one of the few employment options available to women, especially with limited or no education who have families to support. For many women, it may be the only source of household income in many families (Africa Regional Empowerment and Accountability Programme, 2015).

SMEs owned by the women also improve the efficiency of domestic markets and make productive use of scarce resources, thus facilitating long-term economic growth. SMEs also seem to have advantages over their large-scale competitors in that they are able to adapt more easily to market conditions changes. They are able to withstand adverse economic conditions because of their flexible nature. The sector has the potential to contribute towards reducing poverty among both rural and urban cities.

Women comprise 70-80% of informal cross border traders in the southern Africa region and that ICBT contributes to women's livelihoods – both at the individual and household level- as well as food security and national and regional economic growth and trade (USAID, 2017).

The Informal Cross Border Trades (ICBT) done by women accounts for some 30 to 40% of intra-SADC trade and they contribute to economic growth by increasing business activity through their import and export of goods and employment creation at the national and regional level (UNCTAD, 2010). They also contribute to governments' revenues via duty, license, and passport fees. According to key informants from the Mwanza Land Border of the Malawi Revenue Authority (MRA), Malawi's trade policy recognizes ICBT and its impact on easing unemployment.

Challenges faced by women-owned SMEs

There are four areas of financing that previous research has noted can pose particular problems for women. Firstly, women may be disadvantaged in their ability to raise start-up finance. Secondly, guarantees required for external finance may be beyond scope of most women's personal assets and credit track record. Thirdly, once business is established, finance may be more difficult for female entrepreneurs to rise than for their male counterparts because of the greater difficulties that women face in penetrating informal financial networks. Finally, the relationship between female entrepreneurs and bankers may suffer from sexual stereotyping and discrimination (Carter, 2000).

The research carried out by the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development and the United Nations Industrial Development Organization in Zambia in 2000 based on 35 women entrepreneurs revealed that women's full economic potential is not being tapped. The

main obstacles for women entrepreneurs in this study include lack of capital, lack of infrastructure for business, as well as lack of training, lack of innovation, networking and assistance from government agencies.

The research from the State University in Kenya on the constraints faced by SME's in Kenya revealed that business financing in terms of start-up and capital for continued operations is cited as the greatest problem for small women's business development (Cooley and Lutabwinda, 2001).

There are also several key constraints for Informal Cross Border Traders. While free trade area has helped ease border taxes in Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa region, there are still a range of taxes and charges, many which are quite costly for traders. Additionally, inadequate access to finance and financial resources is a chronic problem for women ICBTs; 80% of ICBTs obtain capital from informal sources and rotating savings clubs are highly popular. A key finding from field research is the enormous information gap between ICBTs and border agents. Many Malawian revenue authorities insisted that customs rules are clear, but ICBTs disagree and expressed concerns about being harassed, cheated and overcharged by the MRAs. Many ICBT's also complained of high rates of GBV to, from, and at borders (USAID, 2017).

The legal situation of African women in business is improving. Nevertheless, women still have inadequate access to finance in general and, more specifically, to working capital for their businesses. Limited access to financial resources for doing business is a chronic problem for women ICBTs. According to COMESA (2012), nearly 80% of ICBTs obtain their capital from informal sources while about half used their own savings. Financial support from family and friends are particularly important sources of finance for up to 68% of women. Only one-fifth of traders have access to bank loans, and 62% of these are men, mostly in Ugandan border towns (Blumberg et al., 2016).

A key finding from the field research is the enormous information gap between the ICBTs, especially women ICBTs and customs officials, both high-level and "front-line" (Blumberg et al., 2016). The situation is exacerbated by the lack of posted customs rules and regulations at all the borders visited by the researchers. Researchers asked representatives of all the major border agencies, "Would you be in favor of a large, laminated poster that contains all the latest rules and regulations about [customs duties, immigration rules about length of stay, etc...] being mounted on the wall in a high-traffic area of your office, where it would be visible to all?" All of the agencies agreed that this would be a good idea. In some cases, a follow-up question was asked, "Should a complete, printed set of the rules and regulations be available to those who pass through their border agency?" Here too, the response was very positive. This is an initiative that can be followed up and easily

Table 1. Problems faced by informal cross-border traders.

Problem	Male	Percentage	Female	Percentage
Multiple control post	28	7.1	57	39
High cost of transport				
Insecurity	26	6.6	60	15.15
Harassment				
Multiple and arbitrary taxation of good	16	4.1	57	14.39
High cost of communication	3	0.8	37	9.34
Poor accommodation and storage	2	0.5	51	12.8
Total	89	22.47	306	77.27

Source: Authors' construction using UNIFEM (2008) baseline survey data.

monitored.

As with other sectors, gender inequalities also manifest themselves in informal trade and affect the way in which women make their living. According to International Labour Office (1991), informal trade is the most important source of employment among self-employed women in sub-Saharan Africa. Women therefore play a critical role in addressing vital issues of livelihoods such as food and income security. The SADC Gender Protocol is also critical for women in informal cross-border trading, especially Article 17 on economic empowerment which states that State Parties shall, by 2015, adopt policies and enact laws which ensure equal access, benefit and opportunities for women and men in trade and entrepreneurship, taking into account the contribution of women in the formal and informal sectors (Makombe, 2011). Table 1 shows challenges faced by women face in Central Africa (Njikam, 2011).

By looking at the earlier discussed, it can be noted few mentioned challenges (especially customs challenges) that are faced by cross-border women and one would conclude that cross border entrepreneurs are not much recognized or not much has been done to assist the cross-border entrepreneurs, hence, the aim of this research to fill that gap which other researchers did not do.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

A total of 30 participants were targeted in the study. The women traders undertaking their businesses in Limbe were involved in the study. MRA and IBAM-Indigenous Business Association of Malawi both based in Blantyre City were also selected to participate in the study. The location of the study was in Blantyre due to limited resources. The women participants in the study were those who do cross-border business and are situated in Limbe Town. It was easy to collect data from them since most of them are located in one area. These women do cross border business, for example, Zambia, Zimbabwe, South Africa and Tanzania. They are involved in clothes business, groceries and many more. Hence, they have vast experience in crossing the borders and the challenges faced in the process.

Data collection method

This study used a mix research approach. Qualitative research was based on interviews conducted with the participants, while quantitative research was used by administering a questionnaire to the participants. The study also collected secondary data by reviewing the policies that MRA and IBAM have. In total, 30 questionnaires were distributed to the selected SMEs owners, MRA and IBAM officials and 24 were valid providing a response rate of 80%.

Study sample

Cross-border traders are many and it was difficult and impossible to involve all of them in the study, hence, the study was restricted to Limbe Town. A sample size of 30 women participants was targeted and the participants were selected purposively from Limber Town. Other principal participants in the study who were interviewed were MRA and IBAM officials. Table 2 shows the participants who were involved in the study.

RESULTS

The population of Malawi as a country is made up of 52% women. Women play a greater role in our society including businesses as such they contribute tremendously to the economy. According to Blumberg et al. (2016) in Malawi, the women traders make up to at least 70% of the ICBTs. Malawi Revenue Authority (MRA) officials stated that women account for 80% of the people crossing the Mwanza In-land Border Post with Mozambique being the busiest and highest-volume land post in the country.

The challenges that cross border women face

The biggest challenge faced by informal cross-border women traders is the lack of adequate funds to support their small businesses. Other key challenges faced by women include corruption by tax officers, unfair charges by MRA officers, unstable import charges, high running

Table 2. Number of participants and the responses.

Variable	Questionnaires distributed	Response	Location
Women traders interviewed	28	22	Limbe
MRA	1	1	Nsonkho House
IBAM	1	1	Blantyre

local costs, unstable exchange rate of kwacha against other currency, unstable prices from the source and unreliable transportation respectively.

Corruption by taxation officials

From the 24 participants who took part in the study, 22 raised the issue about corruption by the tax officials. Thus, in total, 91.7% of the respondents were in agreement that the tax officials were corrupt in the discharge of their duties at the border post.

Unfair charge/treatment by MRA

Out of the 24 participants, 22 of the respondents representing 91.7% expressed concern about the bad treatment by MRA officials that includes rough responses, unwillingness to explain to them how they arrive and calculate the tax and custom duty charges and unwillingness to negotiate the charges.

High customs duty

Customs duty is collected on the goods that are imported from other countries. A total of 8 out of 24 respondents representing 33.3% expressed that the customs duty paid by the women traders was too high.

High running costs

A total of 15 out of 24 study participants representing 62.5% complained that the running or operational costs of their small businesses was too high. The running costs are in the form of infrastructure, like rentals and others.

Unstable exchange rate against other currencies

The major currency which they use mostly is dollar and rand. During off season, these currencies tend to gain more power and this gives a lot of challenges to the cross-border women traders. Out of the 24 participants, 20 of them representing 83.3% echoed this problem of unstable exchange rate. This brought uncertainty to their small businesses.

Unstable prices from the source

Out of the 24 respondents, 5 of them representing 20.8% expressed the displeasure about the unstable price from the place of origin, e.g., South Africa, China, Dubai, Zambia and Tanzania.

Unreliable transportation

Out of the 24 women participants, 10 which represent 41.7% echoed the problem of transport cost. The transportation cost includes both the vendors and the goods.

Lack of capital

Out of the 24 study participants, 15 which represent 62.5% have also complained of their inability to access finance from banks and other lending institutions as they are considered to be high risk.

Source of funds by cross border women

From the 24 respondents, some explained that they sourced their finance from banks, village banks, family members and some from their own personal savings.

Table 3 shows that most of the women sponsor themselves through personal savings and this represents 58.3% of the study participants. Those that get capital from family members represent 12.5%, village banks represent 25% and from formal banks represents only 4.2%.

Malawi revenue authority

According to the Malawi Revenue Authority, most of the women do not understand the policies concerning import duties. As such they do not even keep enough money for clearing the goods. It is when they arrive at the border that they start panicking thinking that the charges are negotiable, but according to the information that was gathered the import charges are fixed and non-negotiable. These are gazette charges and therefore cannot be changed.

When asked about the free allowance that every traveler is supposed to have, the interviewee agreed that

Table 3. Source of funds.

Self	Family members	Village banks	Formal banks
14	3	6	1

indeed there is free allowance of K300,000 but further clarified that this it is only applicable when the so-called allowance is for home use only. Therefore, if the items are in identical form, this cannot be taken as home use. When the interviewee was asked to explain the support that they provide to the cross-border women, the interviewee explained that MRA only provides training to the women once in a while and the focus is not on the policies but rather to encourage them to be paying the import duties.

Asked if they do keep the information about the number of women who cross the border, the interviewee said that they do not keep such information in all the borders except at Nchinji border where they use Simplified Regime which is applicable in all the COMESA countries. In this case, the majority of the women do use Mwanza border post because most of the goods that they transact come from South Africa and Tanzania and the countries are not COMESA members. If someone decides to use Nchinji border post, it means she needs to carry only things that are bought in Zambia according to Simplified Trade Regime Protocol. In that case, there is preferential treatment that they do get but unfortunately only few commodities are bought in Zambia. But even though there is this provision, the issue about smuggling at Nchinji border post is the order of the day.

When asked if there is any special policy that is there to help the ICBT women, the answer was there is no such provision. All ICBT are treated equally. The only thing that MRA does is to provide training to the ICBT women. It is during these meetings that they discuss issues that concern them.

Indigenous Business Association of Malawi

This organization provides training to ICBT in order to build capacity. It also intervenes when the women approach them that they have problems with MRA.

On the issues concerning the challenges the ICBT women face, they accepted that a lot of women have capital inadequacy as a major problem. But unfortunately, there is little that they can help since most of the financiers require collateral. The only way that they encourage them is to form groups where they can put their money together to generate more capital, but unfortunately, this does not happen because of lack trust.

On the issues about policies that are there to support women ICBT, the answer was there is no such policy and there is little that the government has done to support Women ICBT. The only policies that are there for the

promotion of SME's and the "buy Malawi strategy are in the new procurement Act where there is the provision that 60% of the government suppliers should be local Malawians.

DISCUSSION

In developing countries with capital shortages and growing labor surpluses, SMEs are generally more labor intensive than larger businesses, and on average generate more employment opportunities per unit of capital employed (Cronje, 2003). Notwithstanding the importance of SMEs in the economies of third world countries, the SMEs still face serious financial constraints (Cook and Nixson, 2000). SMEs are usually self-financed as they find it difficult to meet stringent demands set by financial lenders who often demand collateral as security which SME's do not readily have. SMES help in employment creation, poverty alleviation and contribute significantly to the GDP of an economy. Nyoni (2002) found that most SMEs are small and argued that smallness is dangerous just like in the animal kingdom where small animals are easy prey for predators. SME's are usually financially weak in the developing world mainly due to lack of access to loans (Lall, 2001). Most of the women ICBT are single mothers who are able to send their children to school and support other dependents. Women's education has a lot of externalities. For instance, a mother's schooling not only improves the quality of her children's intellectual achievement but also her own employment opportunities (Jackson, 1996). Also, investment in women's education increases skill sets, thus, leading to better equipped women who can contribute to the economy (Schultz, 2002).

The challenges the cross-border women face

Corruption by tax officials

The tax officials charge high taxes and duties with the aim of making these cross-border women to be in desperate situation thereby ending up asking for the reductions in the charges which eventually forces them to corrupt the official in order to get low import duty charges. Such practices are rampant in most of the borders.

Unfair charge/treatment by MRA

The argument is that the MRA officials do not show how

they calculate the charges. When they try to bargain, they face cold shoulder from them. This is even worse when one does not have any relative or a friend at the border.

Unstable import charges

They argued that the same item can be paid for at different rates from different individuals, that is, if it is a TV, a person can pay K30,000 while another can pay K50,000. This leaves a lot to be desired. When they try to argue based on this, their arguments are not taken into account.

High customs duty

Customs duty is collected on the goods that are imported from other countries. These women reported that the charges that they do get from MRA officials are very high and this acts as a disadvantage to their business.

High running costs

The running costs are in form of infrastructure. Most of the women do not have their own shops as result they rent from other people. Normally the rentals are on the high side. This has resulted into a lot of women operating from shacks (temporal shelter made from cartons or other related materials). Another running cost is transportation cost from the home country, Malawi to where goods are bought and coming back, along with other local running cost such as aganyu and airtime when it comes to follow up of the whereabouts of their goods. These costs are very high and eat up the profits which the traders could have made.

Unstable exchange rate against other currencies

The major currency which they use mostly is dollar and rand. During off season, these currencies tend to gain more power and this gives a lot of challenges to these women in terms of raising capital for their small businesses. Some women face hard times including their small business going into bankruptcy. Unfortunately, there is little that they can do in order to control this problem.

Unstable prices from the source

The prices keep on changing due to global economic crisis. Every time they go to buy things from their foreign suppliers, they find new prices on the items they want to source for the local market. This reduces profit margins since some customers are difficult to convince about price changes.

Lack of capital

These women express their inability to access finance from banks as they are considered to be high risk. Most of the banks and some lending institutions require collateral from customers in order to give them loans. This becomes impossible for these women to borrow money since they do not have such collaterals. Others continued saying that if they happen to have collateral and surrender it to such money rendering institutions; they end up losing their property due to inability to pay back the loans. Other reasons why people fail to pay back the loans are due to lack of progress in business due to the abovementioned problems.

Full analysis on the challenges faced by cross border women

Comparing all the challenges, it is observed that unfair charges/treatment by MRA and unstable exchange rates against major currencies such as dollar and rand are the common challenges faced by cross-border women.

Opportunities for cross-border women

Despite the aforementioned challenges that the women face, there are some opportunities that if identified and utilized by the women many things can change to their advantage. The opportunities offered through ICBT are related to regional integration, income and employment opportunities, and the changing role within the household, that is, women involvement in the decision-making process. By contributing to the exchange of regional produced goods, the ICBT contributes immensely to the process of regional integration, whose main purpose is to increase Africa's visibility in the global market. Hettne and Söderbaum (2000) has labelled this process as the new regionalism. In addition to moving a substantial volume of goods, the ICBT also provides considerable income opportunities. Another opportunity offered through ICBT was the participation in the decision-making process within the household that enables women to be self-reliant and promotes their independence. The opportunities were manifested in terms of diversification into new products or expansion of existing enterprises. Diversification entails supporting the women to acquire new skills and information, capital for trading and development of marketing strategies. There is untapped potential of export than import, which can be utilized to improve the development of women cross-border SMEs.

How challenges have negatively affected ICBT women

Most of the challenges have led to the slow or stunted growth of women-owned SMEs that ply their trade across

borders. One of the ladies went on to say that though she started the business some time back she has only achieved a little. These challenges are a stumbling block to women ICBT. Some who took loans from village banks and other places complained that due to numerous challenges that they do face, paying back the loans has been a problem and in other circumstances has led to loss of property and others have suffered humiliation.

By looking at such information one would conclude that women ICBT elsewhere in the world face numerous and similar challenges. The findings of the research show that though most of the women face a lot of challenges that include unfair treatment by MRA officials, high running cost, lack of infrastructure, unstable exchange rate and unstable markets from the source in cross border trade, none of them mentioned something about the policies, that is, how the MRA calculates the customs charges. This can be a sign that most of them are not aware of the policies that govern the cross-border trade and its charges. That is why a lot of them have cried foul on the import charges and yet they cannot argue based on principles. This is also an indication that a lot of women ICBT have their literacy level very low. On the other hand, none of them indicated the relationships among themselves that would help in finding solution to their problems; this may also be an indication that there is lack of corporation among women ICBT. Corporation can help to form strong teams that can enhance their capacity in terms of loan accessibility from formal financial institutions. There is no direct designated office at MRA where women ICBT can go and lodge complaints in as border challenges are concerned. MRA indicated that they provide training to women ICBT where the issues of customs policies are shared and yet none indicated the knowledge about such trainings. It was discovered that most of the women interviewed do not have knowledge about IBAM and its role, and yet IBAM indicated that they do work hand in hand with women ICBT. Then also, one would wonder about the criteria used by IBAM to identify these ICBT women. Therefore, even though a lot has been achieved by these women ICBT, there is gap that exists between IBAM, MRA and ICBT.

Experiences

Table 4 shows the most common goods that are imported from other countries into Malawi.

Countries where goods are imported

The following are the countries that goods are mostly imported from; South Africa, Tanzania, Zimbabwe, Zambia, China, Dubai and Mozambique. Among these countries, South Africa, followed by China, Dubai then Tanzania are the most countries where goods are imported. South Africa, Zambia, Zimbabwe and

Mozambique are the members of SADC and as such there is a provision whereby goods bought from member countries are exempted from other charges provided the trader gets SADC certificate from where she bought the goods. In this case only value added tax is paid. Again, Zambia is the member of COMESA and being a member of COMESA there is trade regime protocol where member states are supposed to benefit.

The age group among the cross-border women

Most of the cross-border women traders' age is between 25-45. This is so because they are still energetic and most of them have low education background due to poverty, lack of parental care and lack of school fees.

Conclusion

The study indicates that women cross-border SMEs face many challenges on border posts due to overcharge on customs duty which affects their small businesses. The study further revealed that government policies were not clearly spelt out so as to enhance the performance of SMEs. The current tax regimes and regulatory framework is making business by SMEs difficult.

The study concludes that a coherent SMEs policy set by government, sound business management and availability of financial resources to SMEs by the financial services sector will be a welcome relief to the challenges faced by women SMEs in Malawi. It has been established that the majority of the women practicing cross border trade have low or zero literacy levels. However, literacy among the women traders is important, as it would facilitate easier understanding of government policies and regulations; hence, increasing their understanding as far as customs duty is concerned. This would also enable them make strategic decisions for investments with the finances generated from the trade. For instance, SADC and COMESA protocols and treaties are there to support most of the SMEs but unfortunately only few are aware, understand and know about such privileges.

FURTHER INVESTIGATION AND STUDY

Due to limited time and resources the research focused only on ICBT based in Blantyre, especially Limbe Town traders and also got other information from both MRA and IBAM. Further study may be helpful if there is a need to understand the challenges faced by the cross-border women traders beyond this research.

CONFLICT OF INTERESTS

The authors have not declared any conflict of interests.

Table 4. Goods that are mostly imported by cross border women.

Goods	Imported from
Building materials	China
Clothes, building materials, kitchen ware, and groceries	South Africa
Stationery and hardware	Dubai
Textile and groceries	Tanzania
Textile	Zimbabwe
Groceries	Zambia
Groceries	Mozambique

REFERENCES

- Ackah J, Vulvor S (2011). The challenges faced by Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) in obtaining Credit in Ghana. Blekinge Institute of Technology, School of Management, Sweden. Available at: <http://www.diva-portal.org/smash/record.jsf?pid=diva2%3A829684&dswid=-2150>
- Africa Regional Empowerment and Accountability Programme (2015). Empowerment matters: The process of surfacing the perspectives of women cross border traders in Southern Africa. Available at: <http://tripleline.com/downloads/publications/AREAP-Case-Study-2-Empowerment-Matters.pdf>
- Aryeetey EA (1994). Small Enterprise Finance under Liberalization in Ghana. Available at: <https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/10007>
- Blumberg RL, Malaba J, Meyers L (2016). Contributions, Constraints, and Opportunities. The United States Agency for International Development. Available at: https://www.agrilinks.org/sites/default/files/resource/files/ICBT%20Gender%20Assessment%20Report_Final_4-30-2016.pdf
- Carter C (2000). Gender and Enterprise. London: Academic Press.
- COMESA Annual Report (2012). Enhancing Intra-COMESA Trade through Micro, Small and Medium Enterprise Development. Available at: https://www.comesa.int/wp-content/uploads/2019/02/Annual-Report-2012_final_27th_final.pdf
- Cook P, Nixon F (2000). Finance and small and medium-sized enterprise development. Manchester: Institute for Development Policy and Management, University of Manchester.
- Dalitsio K, Peter Q (2000). The policy environment for promoting small and medium-sized enterprises in Ghana and Malawi. University of Manchester.
- Fleisig H, Safavian M, De la Peña N (2006). Reforming collateral laws to expand access to finance. The World Bank.
- Gockel AF, Akoena SK (2002). Financial Intermediation for the Poor: Credit Demand by Micro Small and Medium Scale Enterprises in Ghana: a Further Assignment for Financial Sector Policy? ILO.
- Hettne B, Söderbaum F (2000). Theorising the rise of regionness. *New Political Economy* 5(3):457-472.
- International Labour Office (1991). The dilemma of the informal sector : report of the Director-General. Part 1. Available at: <https://trove.nla.gov.au/work/19820503?selectedversion=NBD7897571>
- Jackson S (1996). Gender, Sexuality and Heterosexuality. *Feminist Theory* 7(1):105-121
- Justice NE (2010). Cross Border Testimonies, Cape Town.
- Kihimbo BW, Ayako BA, Omoka KW (2012). Collateral requirements for financing of small and medium enterprises (SMEs) in Kakamega Municipality, Kenya. *International Journal of Current Research* 4(6):21-26.
- Kongolo M (2010). Job creation versus job shedding and the role of SMEs in economic development. *African Journal of Business Management* 4(11):2288-2295.
- Kunateh MA (2009). Demand for collateral security by Financial Institutions stifles growth of SMEs.
- Lall S (2001). Competitiveness, technology and skills. Books.
- Makombe PF (2011). Informal Cross-Border Trade and SADC: The Search for Greater Recognition. Open Society Initiative for Southern Africa. pp. 44-49.
- MSME (2012). FinScope MSME Survey Malawi 2012. Available at: <https://info.undp.org/docs/pdc/Documents/MWI/Malawi%202012%20MSME%20Main%20Report%20-%20Final.pdf>
- Network Economic Justice (2010). Informal Cross Border Trade. Cape Town: Economic Justice Network.
- Njikam O (2011). Women in informal cross-border trade: Evidence from the Central Africa Region. *African Journal of Business Management* 5(12):4835-4846.
- Nonso N (2013). Creating Jobs through SMEs. *Business Daily*.
- Nyoni S (2002). Small, micro and medium enterprises (SMMEs), policy and strategy framework. Government Printers, Harare.
- Olawale F, Garwe D (2010). Obstacles to the growth of new SMEs in South Africa: A principal component analysis approach. *African Journal of Business Management* 4(5):729-738.
- Peberdy S (2000). Mobile entrepreneurship: Informal sector cross-border trade and street trade in South Africa. *Development Southern Africa* 17(2):201-219.
- Peberdy S, Rogerson C (2000). Transnationalism and non-South African entrepreneurs in South Africa's small, medium and micro-enterprise (SMME) economy. *Canadian Journal of African Studies/The Canadian Journal of African Studies* 34(1):20-40. Report-2012_final_27th_final.pdf
- Schreyer P (1996). SMEs and employment creation.
- Schultz P (2002). Environmental attitudes and behaviors across cultures. *Online Readings in Psychology and Culture* 8(1):4. Available at: <https://scholarworks.gvsu.edu/orpc/vol8/iss1/4/>
- UNCTAD (2006). United Nations Conference on Trade and Development, New York and Geneva: United Nations Publication. Available at: https://unctad.org/en/docs//tdr2006_en.pdf
- UNCTAD (2010). Borderline: Women in informal cross-border trade in Malawi, the United Republic of Tanzania and Zambia.
- UNCTAD/TDR (2006). United Nations Conference On Trade And Development, New York And Geneva: United Nations Publication. Available at: https://unctad.org/en/docs//tdr2006_en.pdf
- UNIFEM Annual Report (2008) www.google.com [Accessed on 24-02 2019]
- UNIFEM Annual Report (2008). Annual Report 2007-2008. Available at: http://iknowpolitics.org/sites/default/files/unifem_annualreport_2007-2008_part1_1.pdf
- USAID (2017). Women Informal Cross-Border Traders in Southern Africa, New York: USAID. Available at: https://banyanglobal.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/05/ICBT-Gender-Assessment-Report_Final_4-30-2016_DEC.pdf

Full Length Research Paper

Incentives as correlates of employees' loyalty towards management in organisation

Idowu H. A. O.^{1*}, Soyebo K. O.² and Adeoye E. A.²

¹Department of Family, Nutrition and Consumer Sciences, Obafemi Awolowo University, Ile-Ife, Nigeria.

²Department of Management and Accounting, Obafemi Awolowo University, Ile-Ife, Nigeria.

Received 27 September, 2017; Accepted 11 September, 2018

The study investigates the effects of incentives on employees' loyalty towards organisational management. It considers the types of incentives structure implemented for employees, and its probable effects on the performance and loyalty of employees to the management of an organisation. Data were collected through the administration of questionnaire to one hundred and twenty respondents, comprising thirty respondents; they were selected using convenience sampling from four organizations namely Sumal Foods Limited, Yale Foods Limited, Coca Cola Bottling Company, and Zartech, all located within Ibadan South west Local Government Area of Oyo State. Data collected were analyzed using descriptive statistics such as frequency counts, percentages, means and standard deviation. The findings revealed that the core of the respondents was within their active ages, with majority (65.8%) being married, (63.3%) having a household size of 3-5, and (79.2%) having post-secondary education. Majority (75%) were full time workers (53.3%), with 11 to 20 years of work experience, while 63.3% earned between ₦19,000 and ₦54,000 per month. The organisations provided tangible and intangible financial incentives to their employees with mean between 2.5-3.5. Respondents indicated that non-availability of all types of incentives will negatively affect loyalty and performance (mean between 3.0 and 3.3). Therefore, for sustained employees' loyalty and increased performance, adequate incentive packages should be available for workers of all categories.

Key words: Incentives, employees' loyalty, organizational management.

INTRODUCTION

The imperative to gain a deep understanding about the interrelationship between giving incentives and enlisting the loyalty of employees has become a major issue to management practitioners. In this respect, Perry et al. (2009) and Frey et al. (2013) alluded to research findings linking pay to commitment and performance. Similarly, Bertelli (2006) posited that intrinsic motivation in terms of

financial compensation could spur employees to higher productivity. As it were therefore, if the assumption by Ogbonnaya et al. (2017) that managers hold common view with respect to the claim that productive employees are considered as instrumental to organizational success is acceptable, it presupposes that performance-based incentives are *sine-qua-non* for individual's loyalty and

*Corresponding author. E-mail: hidowu@cerd.gov.ng. Tel: +234 803 4072001.

commitment to organizational performance.

By and large, employees are considered a vital resource for all organizations irrespective of orientation towards profit making. This is particularly so given the fact that they represent a significant investment in terms of locating firms; undertaking recruitment exercise; conducting training and development programmes; meeting financial obligations; provision of healthcare scheme, all geared towards the accomplishment of organisational goals and objectives. LaMalfa and Expert (2007) posited that employees are the lifeblood of every organisation deserving more than salaries, trainings or benefits. Usually, investments on employees are products of a company's policies, designed to build loyal employees and ensure relatively lengthy tenure at work. Longevity is akin to symbiotic existence between an organisation and its crop of employees, especially as the latter become psychologically attached to the organisation. Iqbal et al. (2015) therefore argued that employees and organizations have a functional two-way relationship as well as mutual commitments between both parties.

Loyalty, as a general term, signifies a person's devotion or sentiment of attachment to a particular object, which may be a person or group of persons, an ideal, a duty, or a cause. It expresses itself in both thought and action and strives for the identification of the interests of the loyal person with those of the object (Britannica, 1998). Indeed, LaMalfa and Expert (2007) opined that emotionally connected employees are deemed fully engaged, optimally productive, feel validated and appreciated in an obvious win-win situation.

Employees' loyalty is the extent to which the personnel are faithful to the organisation, having feelings of bonding, inclusion, care, responsibility, and disposition to personal sacrifice. The requisite conditions which could spur employees towards loyalty at work transcend mere assumption by managers (Dobre, 2013). Employees' loyalty and commitment are closely related concepts. Bateman and Strasser (1984) submitted that commitment of employee is multi-dimensional in nature which involves high degree of employee's dedication with the organisation, their readiness to put forth high level of effort, similarity of objectives and values and a strong wish or desire to be a part of the organisation. Commitment is a constructive assessment of the organisation and its objectives (Sheldon, 1971). According to Buchanan (1974), commitment signifies a psychological relationship between the workers and organisations. Porter et al. (1974) as well as Meyer and Allen (1997) posited that employee commitment is based on faith in the objectives of the company, readiness to put forth high level of effort in the company and a strong wish to be a part of the organisation. Kamalian et al. (2010) therefore concluded that a motivated employee has his/her goals aligned with those of the organisation and accordingly directs efforts toward organisational success.

It is instructive to state that incentives are considered as essential factors which encourage employees to work efficiently. In other words, incentives and reward system enhance workers' capabilities and facilitate the accomplishment of institutions' goals (Baba and Bababe, 2011). In contrast, the absence of a suitable incentive scheme may adversely affect employees' productivity, nay the attainment of institutions' objectives (Palmer, 2012).

Incentives may be financial or non-financial. While financial incentives are largely pecuniary in nature such as salary increments or profit sharing, non-financial incentives are non-monetary and include motivation, praise and commendation from line supervisor, attention from leaders, opportunities to lead projects or task forces, subsidized transportation for staff and provision of free or subsidized refreshment at work. Kompas and Sridevi (2010) thus suggested that managers should adopt both financial and non-financial benefits for employees to encourage better commitment from them.

The existing studies have largely emphasized profit sharing initiatives as employees have the tendency to take their pay and huge benefits for granted (Ogbonnaya et al., 2017). Profit sharing may be considered a high level participation as distinct from the floor level participation. This explains the gap in literature as this study attempts to find out causal relationships between incentives of any kind and the extent of the loyalty of employees toward the management of an organisation.

Objective of the study

The main objective of the study was to assess the effect of incentives, both financial and non-financial, on the loyalty of employees towards the management of an organisation. The specific objectives are to:

- (1) identify the types of incentives given to workers at selected organizations; and
- (2) examine the perceived effects of ineffective incentive on the employees performance and loyalty.

REVIEW OF LITERATURE

Here, the concepts covered in the study from existing literature and attempt to look at the relationships between and among the concepts were covered.

Incentives

Scholars have expressed diverse views about incentive, its definitions and application. Iqbal (2009) posited that incentives are directly related to performance of an individual employee, a team of employees and total

business unit. A unit of performance can be classified as cost savings; volume produced, quality assurance, revenues/return on investments, or increased profit (Kabeer, 2014). The Society of Incentive and Travel Executive (SITE, 1996) as quoted by Joppe and Martin (2001) defines incentive as a management tool that uses an exceptional travel experience to motivate and/or recognise participants or increase level of performance in support of organisational tools. It is a kind of compensation that has been designed to recognise employees' performance and their accomplishment. Meanwhile, from organisational standpoints, incentive is defined as a technique, which is usually used by employers to carry out their aspect of the employment contract, a form of compensation to the employees for their effort (Hartman, 1994). Incentives are tangible or intangible rewards used to motivate a person or group of people to behave in a certain way (Collins et al., 2008). However, Banjoko (2006) regards incentive as variable payments, usually made to employees or a group of employees on the basis of the amount of pre-set output or based on the achieved result. This view was corroborated by Martocchio (2006) in his submission that incentive could be regarded as compensation rather than basic salaries or wages that usually fluctuates in direct proportion with employee's exceptional performance leading to the attainment of some standard set by the organisation.

Types of incentives

Generally speaking, there are two major types of incentives namely financial, or monetary and non-financial or non-monetary. This core classification has also been tagged by Buchan et al. (2000) as either positive, or negative. Expanding this same classification, Condly et al. (2003) identified three types namely: monetary incentive, non-monetary tangible incentive (coupons or vouchers for foods, vacation trip or others), and non-monetary intangible (employee recognition, praise or appreciation on job accomplishment, positive evaluation and feedback). In the main, financial incentives involve granting of monetary rewards. Financial benefits, Kreisman (2002) and Joiner and Bakalis (2006), argued potentially enhance employees' loyalty and organisational commitment. In the same vein, the Development and Learning Organisation (Harrison, 2011) submitted that monetary rewards ensure continuation of the employment relationship, thereby assuring management of solid foundation for succession plan (De Cenzo and Stephen, 1996; Buchan et al., 2000). Non-financial incentives do not involve any payments or benefits and it mostly relates to psychological and emotional fulfilment (Assaf, 1999; Buchan et al., 2000). Milkovich and Newman (2008) underscore this fact in their submission that an emerging perspective indeed

argues that the most important component of the contemporary human resource management is rewards structure. The position is premised on global competition and environmental uncertainty which have combined to awaken a shift from traditional ways of rewards structure to one dependent on employees' performance, skills, initiative, ingenuity, knowledge and competence (Lawler, 2000). By and large, the essence of incentives is to establish linkage with desired behaviour and the outcome that makes the employees feel appreciated (Whetten and Cameron, 2007). Incentives, in summary, involve all economic benefits supplied by the organisation: pay, promotion, verbal recognition and responsibilities (Deperi et al., 2010).

Interconnections among incentives, loyalty, job satisfaction and work performance

The relationship between incentives or rewards and job satisfaction, on one hand as well as job satisfaction and work performance, on the other hand is best appreciated by situating the employee within the context of an organisational success. A survey by Business Management Daily (2015) revealed that 60% of employees stated that they do not feel recognised as they indeed looked forward to better gestures from employers than mere salaries. Accordingly, Business Management Daily (2015) devised two rules considered contingent for employees' loyalty. These are golden rule which stipulates that employees should be treated the same manner management wants the organisation to be treated, and platinum rule which requires that the employees should be treated just as management want customers treated. The level of self-satisfaction derived by individuals or group of employees in the workplace correlates positively with their overall performance (Judge et al., 2001; Kim, 2004).

This proposition reflects the theoretical exposition by Vroom (1964) that "a happy worker is a productive worker". Therefore, when employees' performance decline, Martocchio (2006) argues that it is apposite to address workers' satisfaction rather than isolate their performance for attention. Thorpe and Homan (2000) emphasised the importance of employees' motivation having established a positive relationship between pay and productivity. Moreover, Dubrin (2004) states that employees' motivation through incentive largely results in overall productivity, responsibility and self-development. There is no doubt that an appreciable percentage of employees would, ordinarily, express preference for financial incentives, but in reality, non-financial incentives have been found to be more powerful (Business Management Daily, 2015). In summary, the correlation or direct link among job satisfaction, loyalty and employees' work performance has been proven by empirical evidences from Naff and Crum (1999), Bright,

Table 1. One way ANOVA.

Source	Degree of freedom (Df)	Sum of squares (SS)	Mean of squares (MS)	F-ratio
Between treatment	K-1	$\sum_{j=1}^K n_i(\bar{x}_j - \bar{\bar{x}})$	$\frac{SS_{trt}}{Df_{trt}}$	-
Within treatment (error)	N-K	$\sum_{j=1}^k (n_i - 1)s_j^2$	$\frac{SS_{error}}{Df_{error}}$	$\frac{MS_{trt}}{MS_{error}}$
Total	N-1	$\sum_{j=1}^k \sum_{i=1}^n (x_{ij} - \bar{\bar{x}})^2$	-	-

(2008), Leisink and Steijn, (2008), Judge et al. (2001) and Kim (2004).

METHODOLOGY

The study was carried out in Ibadan South west Local Government Area of Oyo State, Nigeria with its headquarters at Oluyole Estate, Ibadan. The local government serves as the home for many medium to large scale industries, mainly manufacturing, out of which four namely Sumal Foods Limited, Yale Foods Limited, Coca Cola Bottling Company and Zartech were purposely selected for the study based on their relatively equal size. A total of thirty respondents were randomly selected from each of the organisations in the study, totalling one hundred and twenty employees. The respondents were selected from lower factory workers to management staff, with due consideration for years of experience, educational background and age hence, convenience sampling was used to select the respondents. Structured questionnaire was administered on the respondents while the data collected were analysed using one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) shown in Table 1.

Table 2 highlights the various financial and non-financial incentives which organisations give to employees and the percentages of responses on each of the variables. Table 3 shows the perceptions of respondents towards ineffective incentives and its effect on the loyalty and performance of employees within an organisation. Table 4 highlights the various reasons which respondents expressed as being responsible for quitting their jobs.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Table 5 shows the results of the analysis of the data collected on the types of incentives given to employees. It indicates that the value of $F_{\text{calculated}}$ is greater than the value of the F_{table} at each of the three confidence levels, with the consequence that H_1 is accepted. In other words, accepting H_1 is an indication that the types of incentives affect the performance and loyalty of employees within an organisation and its management.

The analysis of the results in Table 6 shows that the $F_{\text{calculated}}$ is greater than the F_{table} at each of the confidence levels, which implies that H_1 is accepted. The results thus showed that ineffective incentives could

adversely affect the performance and loyalty of employees to management and the organisation.

The analysis of the results in Table 7 shows that the value of $F_{\text{calculated}}$ is greater than the value of F_{table} at each of the three confidence levels. It presupposes therefore that H_1 is accepted and that employees may be inclined to quit their jobs work due to financial and non -financial incentives accruing to them within an organisation.

Conclusion

The research aimed at finding out the relationships between incentives and performance of employees in terms of loyalty to management as well as performance within the organisation. Different types of incentives like monetary, intangible and tangible non-monetary were considered in the study and findings indicate that employees were favourably disposed to either financial or non -financial incentives as they bear the capability to affect performance positively or adversely. The implication is that workers' loyalty and performance could be affected by the absence of incentives or non-recognition of its importance by the management of an organisation, such that employees may feel not being important. Moreover, ineffective incentive plays a major role in determining the loyalty to management and performance of employees as findings revealed that employees reject ineffective incentives. The results equally showed that employees were most inclined to quit organisations either for total non-existence or inadequate financial or non-financial incentives. It could thus be safely deduced that incentives play a crucial role in employees' loyalty towards management and their performance within an organisation. Employees' loyalty is considered crucial for improved performance which, by extension determines the likelihood that the goals of an organisation would, or would not be achieved. Organisation without a robust incentive structure could find it difficult, if not impossible to enlist the loyalty of employees towards management.

Table 2. Types of incentives given to employees (n=120).

S/N	Variable	Always [f (%)]	Often [f (%)]	Seldom [f (%)]	Never [f (%)]
1	Organisation pays you salaries/ wages promptly	74 (61.7)	38 (31.7)	3 (2.5)	5 (4.2)
2	Organisation gives bonuses to you	30 (25)	67 (55.8)	3 (2.5)	20 (16.7)
3	Are retired employees of the organisation paid pension/Is there a pension scheme for active employees	55 (45.8)	61 (50.8)	1 (0.8)	3 (2.5)
4	There is housing allowance or subsidised housing for staff	55 (45.8)	55 (45.8)	3 (2.5)	7 (5.9)
5	The organisation encourages staff who work overtime by properly remunerating them	41 (34.1)	59 (49.2)	2 (1.7)	18 (15)
6	The supervisor adequately monitors your performance and progress	52 (43.3)	59 (49.2)	4 (3.3)	5 (4.2)
7	Does the organisation provide equal opportunity for all employees regardless of age, sex or ethnicity	46 (38.3)	43 (35.8)	8 (6.7)	23 (19.2)
8	There is training, workshop or seminar for the workers	51 (42.5)	60 (50)	5 (4.2)	4 (3.3)
9	There is a staff bus provided for the transportation of workers	37 (30.8)	31 (25.8)	2 (1.7)	50 (41.7)
10	The organisation allows employees to go on holiday and/ or have off days	48 (40)	45 (37.5)	9 (7.5)	18 (15)
11	The organisation schedules social activities such as staff parties for its employees	31 (25.8)	57 (47.5)	1 (0.8)	31 (25.8)
12	Organisation provides health services for employees, especially sick members of staff	46 (38.3)	65 (54.2)	5 (4.2)	4 (3.3)

Source: Field Survey (2016).

Table 3. Perception of Respondents on how ineffective Incentive structure affects the performance and loyalty of Employees towards management (n=120).

S/N	Variable	Always [f (%)]	Often [f (%)]	Seldom [f (%)]	Never [f (%)]
1	Failure to receive salary on time affects your work performance	45 (37.5)	63 (52.5)	7 (5.8)	5 (4.2)
2	Failure of organisation to increase salary over time make you want to leave for industry competitors	52 (43.3)	59 (49.2)	2 (1.7)	7 (5.8)
3	Insufficient salary, wages and bonuses make you tire of your organisation and make you think of eventually leaving	60 (50)	42 (35)	9 (7.5)	9 (7.5)
4	Are you loyal to your organisation even when there's no job security?	60 (50)	40 (33.3)	8 (6.7)	12 (10)
5	Productivity drops when you're treated unfairly or discriminated against in the organisation	46 (38.3)	46 (38.3)	9 (7.5)	19 (15.9)
6	Lack of proper training for workers reduces their output	55 (45.8)	53 (44.2)	5 (4.2)	7 (5.8)
7	If workers are left alone without adequate supervision, will the quality of their output be poor?	33 (27.5)	72 (60)	7 (5.8)	8 (6.7)
8	When you become tired productivity drops if you're not given holiday or days off	59 (49.2)	47 (39.2)	11 (9.1)	3 (2.5)
9	Lack of recognition from management/supervisors make you feel undervalued	70 (58.3)	41 (34.2)	3 (2.5)	6 (5)
10	Lack of empathy for a sick member of staff affect loyalty and performance negatively	56 (46.6)	54 (45)	8 (6.7)	2 (1.7)

Source: Field Survey (2016).

RECOMMENDATION

The study reveals that incentives play a great part

in enlisting the loyalty of employees to management of an organisation. It supports the arguments of scholars that organisations should

place adequate emphasis on the issue of incentives as a means to spurring employees to higher performance in terms of productivity and

Table 4. Reasons why employees quit organisations (n=120).

S/N	Variable	Always [f (%)]	Often [f (%)]	Seldom [f (%)]	Never [f (%)]
1	Likely to quit your job if you feel devalued or unrecognized	52 (43.4)	51 (42.5)	7 (5.8)	10 (8.3)
2	Will quit in the event of too little training or feedback from management	39 (32.5)	54 (45)	20 (16.7)	7 (5.8)
3	Failure of organisations to provide growth and career advancement opportunities forced employees to quit	51 (42.5)	56 (46.7)	9 (7.5)	4 (3.3)
4	Lack of clear expectations make workers quit organisations	49 (40.9)	54 (45)	13 (10.8)	4 (3.3)
5	Employees struggling from stress due to overwork and work-life imbalance usually quit	53 (44.2)	56 (46.7)	7 (5.8)	4 (3.3)
6	Loss of trust or confidence make you want to quit	72 (60)	40 (33.3)	3 (2.5)	5 (4.2)

Source: Field Survey (2016).

Table 5. Statistical results of types of incentives given to employees.

Source	Df	SS	MS	F _{calculated}	F _{table} (% confidence level)		
					99%	95%	90%
Between treatment	3	9,774.6	3,258.2	27.0374	27.0374	2.824	2.22
Within treatment (error)	44	5302.3059	120.507				

Table 6. Statistical results of ineffective incentives.

Source	Df	SS	MS	F _{calculated}	F _{table} (% confidence level)		
					99%	95%	90%
Between treatment	3	20,543	6,6847	110.5	4.39	2.872	2.25
Within treatment (error)	36	2,231	61.9722				

Table 7. Statistical results of reasons of why employees quit.

Source	Df	SS	MS	F _{calculated}	F _{table} (% confidence level)		
					99%	95%	90%
Between treatment	3	11,934.6	3,978.12	82.162	4.94	3.10	2.38
Within treatment (error)	20	968.36	48.418				

continued commitment to the future of such organisations. It thus buttresses the submission of Meyer and Allen (1991) that employees with a

strong loyalty and commitment are naturally inclined to stake their working career to their organization. It equally lends credence to the

conclusion of Buchan et al. (2000) that an organisation requires an all-inclusive incentive schemes to reward and recognise employees'

performance in direct proportion to their respective productivity. Therefore, organisation would secure its future as long as it adopts meaningful incentive packages which cut across financial and non-financial gestures to employees.

CONFLICT OF INTERESTS

The authors have not declared any conflict of interests

REFERENCES

- Assaf A (1999). Managerial Behaviour in Contemporary Organisations. Amman: Dar Zahran. (Source in Arabic).
- Baba Gana A, Bababe FB (2011). The effect of motivation workers performance. A case of Maiduguri Flour Mill Ltd, Borno State, Nigeria. *Continental Journal of Social Sciences* 4(2):8-13.
- Banjoko SA (2006). Managing corporate reward systems. Pumarik Nigeria Limited.
- Bateman TS, Strasser S (1984). A longitudinal analysis of the antecedents of organizational commitment. *Academy of Management Journal* 27(1):95-112.
- Bertelli AM (2006). Motivation crowding and the federal civil servant: Evidence from the US Internal Revenue Service. *International Public Management Journal* 9(1):3-23.
- Bright L (2008). Does public service motivation really make a difference on the job satisfaction and turnover intentions of public employees?. *The American Review of Public Administration* 38(2):149-166.
- Britannica E (1998). *The Definition of Loyalty*.
- Buchan J, Thompson M, O'May F (2000). Incentives and remuneration strategies. Health workforce incentive and remuneration. A research review (No. 4). Discussion paper.
- Buchanan B (1974). Building organizational commitment: The socialization of managers in work organizations. *Administrative Science Quarterly* 19(4):533-546.
- Business Management Daily (2015). Ways to Optimize Your Employee Benefits Program: Low-cost employee incentives, recognition programs and employee rewards. Available at: <https://training.businessmanagementdaily.com/3068/employee-benefits/>
- Collins A, Bronte-Tinkew J, Burkhauser M (2008). Using incentives to increase participation in out-of-school time programs. Washington, DC: Child Trends. Available at: https://www.childtrends.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/05/child_trends-2008_06_18_pi_ostincentives.pdf
- Condly SJ, Clark RE, Stolovitch HD (2003). The effects of incentives on workplace performance: A meta-analytic review of research studies 1. *Performance Improvement Quarterly* 16(3):46-63.
- De Cenzo DA, Robbins SP (1996). *Human resource management*. John Wiley and Sons. New York. USA.
- Deperi S, Tortia E, Capita M (2010). Incentives, job satisfaction and performance: Empirical evidence in Italian social enterprises. *European Research Institute on Cooperatives and Social Enterprises Working Papers*. Available at: https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=1698598
- Dobre O (2013). Employee motivation and organizational performance. *Review of Applied Socio-Economic Research* 5(1):53-60.
- Dubrin A (2004). *Leadership: Researching findings, practice, and skills* (4th ed.). Boston, MA: Houghton Mifflin.
- Frey BS, Homberg F, Osterloh M (2013). Organizational control systems and pay-for-performance in the public service. *Organization Studies* 34(7):949-972.
- Harrison R (2011). *Learning and Development (fifth edition)*, Development and Learning in Organizations: An International Journal 26:1. Available at: <https://www.emeraldinsight.com/doi/full/10.1108/dlo.2012.08126aaa.013#>
- Hartman RJ (1994). Incentive programs to improve transit employee performance (No. 3). Transportation Research Board.
- Iqbal A, Tufail MS, Lodhi R (2015). Employee loyalty and organizational commitment in Pakistani organizations. *Global Journal of Human Resource Management* 3(1):1-11.
- Iqbal N (2009). Effects of Compensation on Employees work performance. Accessed 26 November, 2010.
- Joiner TA, Bakalis S (2006). The antecedents of organizational commitment: the case of Australian casual academics. *International Journal of Educational Management* 20(6):439-452.
- Joppe M, Martin D (2001). Determining the return on investment of incentive travel programs. SITE Foundation.
- Judge TA, Thoresen CJ, Bono JB, Patton GK (2001). The Job Satisfaction-Job Performance Relationship: A Qualitative and Quantitative Review. *Psychological Bulletin* 127(3):376-407.
- Kabeer N (2014). *Gender and Social Protection Strategies in the Informal Economy*. Routledge India.
- Kamalian AR, Yaghoubi NM, Moloudi J (2010). Survey of relationship between organizational justice and empowerment (A case study). *European Journal of Economics, Finance and Administrative Sciences* 24(2):165-171.
- Kim S (2004). Individual-level factors and organizational performance in government organizations. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory* 15(2):245-261.
- Kompasso SM, Sridevi MS (2010). Employee engagement: The key to improving performance. *International Journal of Business and Management* 5(12):89-96.
- Kreisman BJ (2002). Insights into employee motivation, commitment and retention pp. 1-24.
- LaMalfa K, Expert L (2007). The top 11 ways to increase your employee loyalty. Business Week Technology Research. Available at: <http://www.customerservicegroup.com/pdf/allegianceincreaseloyalty.pdf>
- Lawler EE (2000). *Rewarding excellence: Pay strategic for the new economy*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers. Available at: <http://psycnet.apa.org/record/2000-07201-000>
- Leisink P, Steijn B (2009). Public service motivation and job performance of public sector employees in the Netherlands. *International Review of Administrative Sciences* 75(1):35-52.
- Martocchio JJ (2006). *Strategic Compensation: A Human Resource Management Approach*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- Meyer JP, Allen NJ (1991). A three-component conceptualization of organizational commitment. *Human Resource Management Review* 1(1):61-89.
- Meyer JP, Allen NJ (1997). *Commitment in the Workplace: Theory, Research, and Application (Advanced Topics in Organizational Behavior)*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Milkovich GT, Newman JM (2008). *Compensation*. Texas: Business Publications Inc. Available at: https://trove.nla.gov.au/work/7738502?q&sort=holdings+desc&_=1539687278779&versionId=220610743
- Naff KC, Crum J (1999). Working for America: Does public service motivation make a difference?. *Review of Public Personnel Administration* 19(4):5-16.
- Ogbonnaya C, Daniels K, Nielsen K (2017). How Incentive Pay Affects Employee Engagement, Satisfaction, and Trust. *Harvard Business Review*. Available at: https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Chidiebere_Ogbonnaya/publication/315084064_How_Incentive_Pay_Affects_Employee_Engagement_Satisfaction_and_Trust/links/5b106a69a6fdcc4611d9779b/How-Incentive-Pay-Affects-Employee-Engagement-Satisfaction-and-Trust.pdf
- Palmer W (2012). *Incentive and Disincentive: Will They Affect Performance*.
- Perry JL, Engbers TA, Jun SY (2009). Back to the Future? Performance-Related Pay, Empirical Research and Peril of Persistence. *Public Administration Review* 69:39-51.
- Porter W, Steers RM, Mowday RT, Boulian PV (1974). Organizational commitment, job satisfaction, and turnover among psychiatric technicians. *Journal of Applied Psychology* 59(5):603.
- Sheldon ME (1971). Investments and involvements as mechanisms producing commitment to the organization. *Administrative Science Quarterly* 16(2):143-150.

Society of Incentives for Travel Executives (SITE) (1996). Incentive move business: Incentive Travel: The smart business proposition. Available at: http://incentivatetravel.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/08/SITE_Foundation_Study_2_v3_LR_Singles_F-2.pdf

Thorpe R, Homan G (2000). Strategic Reward System. London: Prentice Hall.

Vroom VH (1964). Work and Motivation, New York: Wiley.

Whetten DA, Cameron KS (2007). Developing Management Skills. New York: Pearson Education.

Related Journals:

